Changing consumer behaviour to reduce demand for illegally-trafficked wildlife products

Sabri Zain, Director of Policy, TRAFFIC
Why reduce demand?
TRAFFIC is a joint programme of WWF and IUCN.

**Demand Reduction**
- Social marketing messaging placed in public places/key locations where they can reach consumers, including online
- Institutional action (e.g. Codes of Conduct) and social marketing messaging issued by business leaders and ‘style’ icons/influential figures in society
- Individual action, social marketing messaging and behavioural change demonstrated by business leaders and ‘style’ icons/influential figures in society

**Supply Reduction**
- Promoting strengthened governance and more integrated approaches to effective law enforcement
- Providing tailored training to build the skills, confidence and capacity of frontline law enforcement officials
- Physical and online market monitoring, & provision of actionable information to relevant enforcement authorities

**Theory of Change Starving Supply & Reducing Demand**
- Starving the supply of illegal goods to consumers
- Reducing the demand for illegal goods by consumers
London Declaration, 2014

“Support, and where appropriate undertake, **effectively targeted actions** to eradicate demand and supply for illegal wildlife products, including but not limited to, raising awareness and changing behaviour. Government support is important to ensure demand and supply side reduction efforts are implemented on the scale and in the time-frame needed to have a meaningful impact. Governments should work in partnership with relevant stakeholders, including civil society, sectoral experts and key influencers, including business. Actions should be **scientific and clearly evidence based, building on research into users’ values and behaviour**, and form part of coherent demand and supply side reduction strategies.”
Kasane Statement, 2015

“Conduct research to improve understanding of the drivers of demand and collate a portfolio of demand reduction good practice to develop guidance for countries about how to successfully reduce consumer demand for illegal wildlife products. We invite interested countries and international organisations to convene a conference of leading experts to provide Governments and others with the tools needed to strengthen action to reduce demand for illegal wildlife products.”

Hanoi Statement, 2016

31 individual national level commitments on demand reduction from Cambodia, Cameroon, China, Ethiopia, France, Germany, Indonesia, Malawi, Myanmar, South Africa, UAE, UK, US, Viet Nam and the European Union.
“Take targeted action to eradicate supply and transit of and demand for illegal wildlife products including through raising awareness of illegal trade in wildlife and its impacts while respecting and protecting the legal and sustainable trade of wildlife product” - UNEA Resolution, 2014

“Urges Member States to engage actively in efforts to raise awareness about and address the problems and risks associated with the supply and transit of and demand for illegal wildlife products and to reduce the demand using targeted strategies in order to influence consumer behaviour” - UNGA Resolution, 2015
First-ever CITES Resolution on ‘Demand reduction strategies to combat illegal trade in CITES-listed species’

• conduct in-depth and regular research on the demand for specimens of illegally traded CITES-listed species, where possible, using standard methodologies to understand the drivers and dynamics of the demand and to provide solid information for use in demand-reduction campaigns

• actively develop and implement well-targeted, species-specific, evidence-based campaigns by engaging key consumer groups and targeting the motivations for the demand and develop specific messaging approaches and methods for target audiences

Decisions 17.44 - 17.48 on Demand Reduction
Listing of all Asian and African species of pangolins on Appendix I of CITES

First-ever CITES Resolution on ‘Conservation of and Trade in Pangolins’

• Encourages consumer States to conduct research on the uses of pangolin specimens, and on consumers and their motivations for consumption of pangolin parts and derivatives, such as scales, meat, leather and other cultural uses, to implement measures to reduce the demand for illegal pangolin specimens on the basis of the results of such research, and to initiate targeted communication campaigns

Decision 17.239 on pangolins - CITES Secretariat report on specific demand management, education and awareness-raising measures concerning pangolins
TRAFFIC is a joint programme of WWF and IUCN

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>COMMON NAME</th>
<th>SCIENTIFIC NAME</th>
<th>COMPLEX CHINESE CHARACTER</th>
<th>SIMPLE CHINESE CHARACTER</th>
<th>PINYIN</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>PANGOLIN SCALE</td>
<td><em>Manis</em> spp.</td>
<td>穿山甲鳞</td>
<td>穿山甲鳞</td>
<td>CHUAN SHAN JIA LIN</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
“Chuan Shan Jia [Pangolin scales] is classified as salty and cool and as entering the Liver and Stomach channels. It is traditionally used in Chinese medicine to disperse blood stasis (for **promoting menstruation and lactation**), reducing swelling and promoting discharge of pus (for **abscesses and boils** etc.) and for expelling wind-dampness (for **pain due to rheumatism/arthritis**).”
Traditional Medicine: Raw Ingredients
Traditional Medicine: Pills and Capsules
Traditional Medicine: Liquids, Oils and Creams

TRAFFIC is a joint programme of WWF and IUCN
Traditional Medicine: Plasters
Wild Meat

- Social / corporate status
- Informal medicine / tonic
Factors influencing consumer preferences, choices and behaviour

- **Wider environment**: E.g. supply, price, legislation, governance etc.
- **Local environment**: E.g. distribution, enforcement, governance etc.
- **Social**: Group norms, beliefs, trends, dynamics, etc.
- **Personal**: Perception, cognition, affect, beliefs, values, habits
Measures to impose a societal behavioural control / restrict choice

(Messageing to shape individual motivation)

Shifting purchasing preferences and buyer behaviour - moving consumers through stages of behaviour change – to achieve changes in Knowledge; Attitudes and Practice, and thus products bought.
Pangolins are being eaten to extinction

An estimated 100,000 are illegally traded every year

Help ZSL save animals under threat of extinction.
Be the Champion our world needs

Fact: Pangolin scale and meat are NOT remedy for fever, pain, or any other medical conditions. It is not lucky charm - and it is not aphrodisiac.

Yet this superstitious are behind a thriving illegal market in pangolin scale and meat - and have made pangolins one of the most world’s endangered species.

Please share the truth about pangolin scale and meat and help stop the illegal trade of pangolins ..............before it is too late.

Pangolins are protected under the Sabah Wildlife Conservation Enactment 1997. Hunting, trading and consumption of pangolins are illegal and will lead to arrest, fine, and jail.

TRAFFIC is a joint programme of WWF and IUCN
Changing Behaviour through Five Steps

1) Behaviour identification
2) Audience segmentation
3) Behaviour modelling
4) Marketing framework development
5) Campaign development and implementation
Behaviour Identification

- **Core Value:**
  - Symbol of wealth
  - Symbol of power
  - Assurance I did the best
  - Peace of mind

- **Emotional Benefits:**
  - Show wealth & status
  - Build up relationships
  - Last resource to treat fatal diseases
  - “Ready when needed”

- **Physical Benefits:**
  - Treat various diseases
  - Reduce hangovers
  - Enhance sexual potency
  - Reduce heat
  - Reduce Toxin

- **Product Description:**
  - Expensive
  - Rare
  - Precious
  - Cold in nature
  - Used by wealthy people
  - Used by patients of fatal diseases
  - Used to treat illnesses for centuries
Rhino Horn is very expensive, precious and rare

- Currently only used among wealthy community

Rhino Horn is believed can treat various diseases
- Keeping it at home to make sure “always ready when needed”

Symbol of power
Symbol of Immortality ‘Unconquerable’, as rhino is thought the most strong among wildlife animals
- Gift to boss / high-rank officer (specially in Hanoi) or for feng shui decoration

Symbol of Wealth

Assurance I did the best
Rhino horn is believed to be able to support cancer treatment and prolong the patient’s life
- Rhino Horn was used as a last resort for those “rejected” by Western medicine doctors

Peace of mind

TRAFFIC is a strategic alliance of WWF and IUCN
Audience Segmentation: Geographical

Overview of pangolin international trade routes in Asia

Map prepared by Sarah Pan et al.

Map based on recent surveys organized by

Table: Availability of pangolin products in different cities in 2005-2006

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>City</th>
<th>Number (%) of markets serving pangolin meat</th>
<th>Number (%) of restaurants serving pangolin meat</th>
<th>Number (%) of TCM wholesale Shops serving pangolin scales</th>
<th>Number (%) of TCM retail Shops serving pangolin scales</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Kunming</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>3 (15.0%)</td>
<td>12 (30.0%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nanning</td>
<td>2 (40.0%)</td>
<td>4 (40.0%)</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>36 (90.0%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fuzhou</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1 (10.0%)</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>39 (97.5%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Guangzhou</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>2 (10.0%)</td>
<td>39 (97.5%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Haikou</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>4 (40.0%)</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>37 (92.5%)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
TRAFFIC is a joint programme of WWF and IUCN.
Audience Segmentation: Psycho-demographics

“Rhino Horn is very expensive, precious, and rare. In the ancient time, only kings and mandarins could afford to use it.”
User female HCMC

“Rhino Horn has a long history and people said it is good to prolong life of the one who suffer from fatal diseases such as cancer, I heard 1 person could extend his life by almost 5 years while of cancer sufferer could only live less than a year”
User male HCMC

“Vietnamese spirit is still “conformity”, there is a need to make sure you are equal with friends so I have to buy it since my friends already has it”
User & Buyer, female, Hanoi

“The rareness of rhino horn made it become valuable; specially with Vietnamese who are really keen with “special, unique” stuff. Mr Tram Bè got the rhino horn of 4 kilos which values of about 40 billion VND, for him this is nothing but having such stuff at home is really something!!!”
Buyer male HCMC

“It is not necessary for health purpose, first is to show off, the second is to reduce drunkenness”
Buyer, male, Hanoi

“It is nice to keep it at home, firstly to reduce drunkenness, and you never know when you really need it; beside it is also good to detoxifying”
Buyer, male, Hanoi
Audience Segmentation: Who is Mr L?

**Consumer Archetype: Mr. L**

A 48 year old property developer, married for 24 years with a mistress. His family lives in a large four-bedroom house in the Ciputra area of Hanoi. He has two children who are 19 and 21 years old.

He is focused on his social status and is therefore potentially vulnerable to outside influences.

He wants to be seen as a leader. However he puts the good of his peer group above himself. Recommendations from his social/business circles are extremely influential.

**WHO ARE THE BUYERS OF THE FUTURE?**

Of those not currently using rhino horn, 16% are “intenders”, individuals who said they wanted to buy or consume rhino horn in the future. It is believed that with the increase of wealth in Viet Nam’s upper-middle class, this group will soon become rhino horn consumers. Even though only 5% of the people surveyed admitted to buying or consuming rhino horn, this percentage is expected to keep growing as intenders acquire the economic power to become consumers.

Career, success, financial security, family preservation, social status and peer lifestyle are top priorities for him.

He believes that rhino horn is a badge of wealth, power, social status and hard work.

He believes rhino horn use gives him peace of mind and happiness.
Consider who:
• Who are your most effective ‘Agents of Change’

Consider what:
• Methods: avoid conservation branding, as no agency for some
• Messages: sufficiently tailored to motivators and drivers?

Consider where:
• Sufficient efforts to reach Mr L? ‘direct’ and ‘indirect’ roll-out
Marketing Framework Development: Messages, Messengers and Mechanisms

- Relaxation & entertainment (resort, hotel, spa, etc.)
- Communications (mobile, email, etc.)
- Religion (Church, pagoda, etc.)
- Networking (Business chambers, social events, etc.)
- Health care (Hospital, dental clinics, gym, etc.)
- Shopping (High-end boutiques, etc.)
- Finance (Bank, Stock market, etc.)
- Information (TV, newspaper, magazine, internet, etc.)
- Travel (Airport, car, motorbike, etc.)
- Sports (golf, tennis, gym, etc.)
Phased Approach: October 2014-September 2015

‘Be Aware’
‘Character’
‘Masculinity’
‘Spirituality’

In Hanoi & HCMC, direct and indirect, to reach Mr L, e.g.:

- Networking events
- Golf clubs, tennis courts
- High-end coffee shops,
- Luxury car dealers
- Luxury goods shops
- VietNam airlines partnership
“Wise men know the truth. They use natural means to keep their body free of toxins. Vitality comes from lifestyle, not from a piece of horn.”
A successful businessman relies on his will and strength of mind. Success comes from opportunities you create, not from a piece of horn.
“A man’s allure and charisma come from within, not from a piece of horn.”
Campaign Implementation

SPIRITUALITY COMES FROM WITHIN

“Good luck comes in many forms. Health. Success. Respect. The lucky man knows that the tallest towers rise from the ground not from a piece of horn.”
Campaign Implementation
How the target audience ‘Mr L’ is hearing about Chi;

38%  
36%  
27%  
17%
57% of Mr. L intend to decrease consumption

64% recommend not to use
TRAFFIC is a strategic alliance of WWF and IUCN

Alternative Behaviours

拥有文化价值 无需声誉代价
TRAFFIC is a joint programme of and **Alternative Behaviours**

拥 有 文 化 价 值 无 需 声 誉 代 价

TRAFFIC is a strategic alliance of WWF and IUCN
TRAFFIC is a strategic alliance of WWF and IUCN.

Alternative Behaviours
TRAFFIC is a joint programme of [Alternative Behaviours]
**Alternative Behaviours**

*Vaccaria segetalis* (Wang Bu Liu Xing) - promotes the movement of blood and encourage lactation

*Gleditsia sinensis* thorns (Zao Jiao Ci) - used to pierce and promote the perforation of sores

Cockle shells (Wa Leng Zi) - reduces abdominal masses, invigorates the blood
Beijing, China, 2015—New Era Health Group has become the first State-owned Chinese company to include a zero tolerance policy towards the use and gifting of illegal and endangered wildlife products within the company’s formal Code of Conduct.

New Era Health Group makes formal commitment not to tolerate illegal wildlife trade
WFCMS/CWCA/TRAFFIC Symposium on Endangered Species Conservation and Sustainable Development of TCM (2013): Organised by the World Federation of Chinese Medicine Societies, China Wildlife Conservation Association and TRAFFIC, traditional medicine sector committed to collaborate with conservationists and raise awareness of the need to eliminate the unnecessary demand for medicinal ingredients derived from species protected by international Conventions and domestic laws.

Forum on Rejecting illegal use of endangered species as TCM ingredients (2014): China’s TCM Corporate Social Responsibility and Sustainability: Representatives from several leading TCM companies have formally renounced the use of endangered plants and animals protected by national and international legislation in medicinal products. Meeting jointly hosted by TRAFFIC and the East China Normal University and co-sponsored by the CWCA and Zhejiang Wecome Pharmaceutical Co. Ltd.
Traditional Medicine Administration (TMA) of the Ministry of Health (MoH) sign five-year memorandum of understanding (MoU) on educating TM practitioners about existing legal regulations regarding the use of endangered wildlife products.

2015: TMA and TRAFFIC, conduct workshops where leading traditional medicine practitioners sign a pledge committing to refrain from any engagement in illegal wildlife trade or in consumption of threatened wildlife species, including as ingredients in traditional medicine.
Some of the success factors and lessons learned along the way…
Messages: Do’s....

1. Focus on the new/good behaviour
2. Appeal to the heart as well as the head
3. Simple message/clear short-term reward
4. Grab people’s attention
5. Understand the culture
6. Don’t just tell people it’s illegal so they shouldn’t do it
Messages: Don’t’s....

7. Don’t moralise, lecture or tell people off

8. Think carefully before using big glossy pictures of powerful animals...

9. Think carefully about telling people animals are at risk of extinction....

10. ....and/or that there is a high price for these products

11. Avoid implying many people are buying illegal products

12. Shock tactics sometimes may not work
13. Don’t over-rely on celebrities – it is the people around you who actually change behaviour

14. Consider who can help you reinforce the message over time

15. Face to face communication is important – not just posters and PSAs
16. Think carefully before using a conservation logo

17. Can you embed your message within an existing successful message?

18. Targeted placements key

19. Behaviour change is a ‘journey’ – move consumers through KAP
WILDLIFE CONSUMER BEHAVIOUR CHANGE TOOLKIT

CHANGING ILLEGAL WILDLIFE CONSUMPTION

This Toolkit has been created to support the 'Community of Practice' working on changing behaviour to reduce consumer demand for illegal wildlife products.

It brings together a wide range of best practice evidence, latest research findings and other resources from the field of consumer behaviour change, based on experience from the conservation sector and beyond.

The Toolkit is regularly updated and we rely on your expert contributions to make it as useful and comprehensive as possible!

To learn more about this Toolkit visit the ABOUT section.

VISIT OUR SPECIFIC RESOURCE CENTRES

We created overviews of specific topics around wildlife consumer behaviour:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>wildlife</th>
<th>consumer behaviour</th>
<th>tools</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>All wildlife</td>
<td>All consumer behaviour</td>
<td>All tools</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Elephant centre</td>
<td>Consumer centre</td>
<td>Campaigns centre</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rhinoceros centre</td>
<td>Government centre</td>
<td>Agreements centre</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tiger centre</td>
<td>Civil society centre</td>
<td>Strategies centre</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

www.changewildlifeconsumers.org
Build a global network of demand reduction experts, practitioners and stakeholders to encourage sharing of information, experience, best practices and expertise, promote greater collaboration and create innovative solutions to reduce the demand for threatened species products.

A Community of Practice

LinkedIn Page

[Link to LinkedIn page]
### What role can you play?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Role</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Advisor</td>
<td>Participating in <strong>project/country specific Steering Groups</strong> and providing expert feedback on broad strategic approaches being used: <em>e.g.</em> to help hone target audience messaging; the key opinion leaders engaged, strengthen monitoring and evaluation protocols, etc.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Blogger</td>
<td><strong>Providing regular Blogs</strong> for a senior professionals’ LinkedIn discussion group and other TRAFFIC online communities, highlighting the latest thinking and research, interpreting lateral links and suggesting application to conservation focused behavioural change goals.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Convener</td>
<td>Helping to <strong>build a conservation-focused behavioural change Community of Practice</strong>, by bringing together those with a relevant perspective on a particular topic: <em>e.g.</em> influencing wide-societal change, or a shift in business management practices, corporate ethics, etc.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Facilitator</td>
<td>Helping to <strong>design and deliver international workshops and Action Learning Set discussions</strong> under three global research projects, exploring what works and what doesn’t in changing consumer behaviour, who is doing what, where, why and with what impact?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Innovator</td>
<td>Identifying the most visually engaging and innovative ways to interact with consumers and those that influence them, by <strong>helping to refresh social marketing imagery and creative design</strong>, and by suggesting new placement locations and additional creative approaches.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**TRAFFIC** is a joint programme of [WWF](https://www.wwf.org) and [IUCN](https://www.iucn.org).
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Role</th>
<th>Task Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Mentor</td>
<td>Mentoring staff in country, providing direct support as a “sounding-board” to talk ideas through, and to help them tackle day-to-day challenges that arise when engaging non-technical audiences in the application of complex behaviour change concepts.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Researcher</td>
<td>Helping to deliver project research by providing input into e.g. evidence base and literature reviews and stakeholder mapping and analysis plans, to consolidate what is known about consumer psycho-demographics, the gaps in knowledge and how to fill them.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Reviewer</td>
<td>Reviewing technical reports, discussion and options papers and other publications, to help quality assure the scientific integrity from a behavioural change perspective for the evidence and insights presented, and ensure objectivity in the recommendations made.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Speaker</td>
<td>Providing keynote and other presentations to international public, private and civil society sector audiences engaged in demand reduction, through participation in TRAFFIC workshops, action learning sets and other activities under our global research projects.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Writer</td>
<td>Helping to create content for an online resource bank, including best practice guides, links to capacity building tools and resources, quality assurance frameworks, case studies and examples of success factors and lessons learned in other sectors.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
What expertise can you contribute?
What research can you conduct and share?
Which stakeholders can you engage?
What creative resources can you share?
What best practices can you share?
Thank You

Sabri.Zain@traffic.org
Gayle.Burgess@traffic.org